# **Appeal Decision**

Site visit made on 7 June 2019

## by Laura Renaudon LLM LARTPI Solicitor

an Inspector appointed by the Secretary of State

Decision date: 19 June 2019

# Appeal Ref: APP/F4410/W/19/3226052 2 Lauder Road, Bentley, Doncaster DN5 9RP

- The appeal is made under section 78 of the Town and Country Planning Act 1990 against a refusal to grant planning permission.
- The appeal is made by Mr K Richardson against the decision of Doncaster Metropolitan Borough Council.
- The application Ref 18/00971/FUL, dated 18 April 2018, was refused by notice dated 15 November 2018.
- The development proposed is erection of 3 bedroom town house.

#### **Decision**

1. The appeal is dismissed.

### **Main Issue**

2. The main issue arising in the appeal is the effect of the proposed development on the character and appearance of the area.

#### Reasons

- 3. 2 Lauder Road lies on a residential estate in the Bentley area to the north of Doncaster. Lauder Road itself is a quiet crescent-shaped residential road, meeting Haslemere Grove (becoming the Queen's Drive to the west) at both ends. Haslemere Grove meets the busy A19 Bentley Road to the east, shortly beyond the appeal site.
- 4. The appeal property lies at the easternmost end of Lauder Road at its junction with Haslemere Grove. Like its adjoining neighbour on Lauder Road, No 4, the house is oriented to face west, and its side elevation faces south onto Haslemere Grove. The side of the house is however aligned with the building line of the houses to the west, facing onto Haslemere Grove to their southern front elevations.
- 5. The immediate context of the property is as a red-bricked semi-detached dwelling with front, side and rear garden, on an estate comprised almost exclusively of similar properties. As a corner plot, the appeal property has a more generous side garden than most. There is some variation in house styles, with some having flat roofs, some comprised of yellow bricks, and some variation in bay window treatments. However the only immediate exception to this semi-detached character is the 'Companions House' conversion of a former public house into flats on Haslemere Grove, opposite the side elevation of the appeal property.

- 6. This character contrasts with the terraced properties on the surrounding streets including Bentley Road, some with commercial shopfronts below. There is a marked transition in character when exiting Bentley Road into Haslemere Grove, with an immediate view of more spacious dwellings, traffic calming measures, and a quieter and more open character.
- 7. The appeal proposal is to erect a house to the southern side of No 2 Lauder Road, resulting in a terrace of 3 houses. The existing frontage car parking to the side of No 2 would be removed, and parking for both dwellings would be to the rear, with access taken from Haslemere Grove, following the demolition of an existing garage. Subject to an acceptable boundary treatment, no objection is raised on highway safety grounds to this, and the living conditions of existing and future occupiers would not be adversely affected.
- 8. As well as removing the existing parking area, the proposal would replace the existing walls and fence with new brick walls of a more satisfactory appearance. At the time of my site visit the appeal property appeared to have suffered extensive fire damage to its rear, including to its garage, and the demolition of this garage, as proposed, would undoubtedly be visually beneficial. Overall, however, given the design and layout of the estate, the proposed development would unacceptably affect the character and appearance of the area.
- 9. The new dwelling would be sited in the side garden of the existing house. Although largely surrounded by a high fence at present, the existing absence of development here supports the open and spacious feel of the area. The proposed house would notably jut out from the established building line of the houses to the west, and be sited much closer to the road than the surrounding properties. As a result it would appear as a prominent and uncharacteristic addition to the street scene that would reduce the openness of the area. The creation of a small terrace would also be incongruous in this context of almost exclusively semi-detached dwellings, save for the pub conversion.
- 10. For these reasons, despite the limited improvements to the boundary treatment and the visually beneficial impacts of removing the existing parking arrangements and garage demolition, the harm to character means that the proposed development would not comply with Policy PH11 of the Doncaster Unitary Development Plan of 1998, which is permissive of new residential development except where harm to character results from the form of development, and it would not comply with Policy CS14 of the Core Strategy of 2011 2028, requiring development of a robust design that positively contributes to character.

#### Other matters

11. The proposed development would create work in construction if it were to go ahead, and new residents would be likely to spend locally. These would result in some limited economic benefits to the area. It is also suggested that housing needs in the area are not being met, by reference to the Council's housing land supply. The proposal would support the Government's policy objective of boosting the supply of housing. No details of the extent of any unmet housing need are before me in evidence, however. The provision of one extra house would be of some benefit but, in the absence of any details as to any unmet housing need, these benefits of the proposal are clearly outweighed by the identified harm to the character of the area.

# **Conclusion**

12. For the above reasons the proposal would not comply with the development plan for the area and would cause harm to the area's character. There are insufficient benefits of the proposal to overcome the conflict with the development plan, and the appeal is dismissed.

Laura Renaudon

**INSPECTOR**